March 19, 2024 (reissued April 5, 2024, with updated bill numbers)

Hon. Michael Barrett Co-Chair, Joint Committee on Telecommunications, Utilities & Energy Massachusetts Senate 24 Beacon St., Room 109-D Boston, MA 02133

Hon. Jeffrey Roy Co-Chair, Joint Committee on Telecommunications, Utilities & Energy Massachusetts House 24 Beacon St., Room 43 Boston, MA 02133

Re: Removing subsidies for woody biomass energy in proposed climate legislation

Dear Senator Barrett, Representative Roy, and Members of the Joint Committee on Telecommunications, Utilities & Energy:

On behalf of the undersigned organizations, we write to oppose provisions concerning woody biomass energy that were included in a bill that recently emerged from the Joint Committee (the "Committee") on Telecommunications, Utilities & Energy. As currently drafted, this legislation would expand subsidies for burning trees for energy, undermining the progress made in the climate law passed last session.¹ We reiterate our support for legislation that would instead <u>remove</u> any remaining ratepayer-funded subsidies for new wood-burning facilities. Clean energy dollars should only go to truly non-emitting technologies.

Oppose Sections 8 and 22 - Woody Biomass Subsidy Expansion - in H.4503

We oppose Section 8 of H.4503, which would <u>expand</u> ratepayer funding of wood-burning facilities through the Alternative Energy Portfolio Standard ("APS"). Specifically, Section 8 would double the Alternative Energy Credit amount per Btu of thermal energy produced by large wood boilers and furnaces if those facilities install (unspecified) emissions control devices. This provision incentivizes spending clean energy dollars on new, polluting, biomass-burning facilities in the Commonwealth; it is also a handout to existing biomass facilities, which are <u>already</u> required to meet emissions standards established by the Department of Energy Resources (or for larger units, by the Department of Environmental Protection).²

¹ An Act Driving Clean Energy and Offshore Wind, Chapter 179 of the Acts of 2022, removed woody biomass from the list of sources eligible for subsidies under the Renewable Energy Portfolio Standard.

² See <u>https://www.mass.gov/info-details/qualifying-woody-biomass-in-the-aps.</u>

According to the most recent emissions data from the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, residential and commercial wood heating accounted for 92% of all fine particulate matter ($PM_{2.5}$) emissions from Massachusetts' heating sector, and 31% of the state's total $PM_{2.5}$ emissions.³ $PM_{2.5}$ emissions are the leading cause of air pollution-related illness and death in the United States and have particularly acute impacts in environmental justice communities and other at-risk populations. Burning wood-based fuel also releases carbon directly into the atmosphere at an accelerated rate (as compared to leaving waste wood in the ecosystem to gradually decompose under normal forest conditions; of course, allowing trees to grow *removes* carbon from the atmosphere). Ratepayers should not be subsidizing the burning of wood-based fuels at all – even where, as here, the draft legislation claims that the intent is "to improve air quality."

We also oppose section 22 of H.4503, which would repeal the provision of the Climate Roadmap Law⁴ that requires the Administration to undertake a biomass health and climate impacts study. Under the Climate Roadmap Law, as of January 1, 2026, biomass is set to be included in the list of "non-carbon emitting sources" for the new greenhouse gas emissions standard ("GGES") for municipal lighting plants ("MLPs"); the biomass study was mandated in conjunction with the creation of the MLP GGES and what was described as a "five-year moratorium" on the inclusion of biomass in that standard. While we believe that there is ample credible scientific information already available on the adverse climate, public health, and environmental impacts of woody biomass energy, <u>Massachusetts continues to require its electric ratepayers to fund the burning of woody biomass</u> – through the APS, and (as of 2026) the MLP GGES. So long as subsidies for wood-burning remain on the books, we will continue to advocate for this study.

Support S.2136/H.3210 and S.2137/H.3211 - End all Rate-Payer Subsides for Polluting Biomass

Governor Healey pledged to "end subsidies for forest bioenergy for electricity and commercialscale heat." As noted, Section 8 of H.4503 would move us further away from this goal, and we strongly oppose its inclusion in any legislation. Instead, we urge the inclusion of the policies set forth in **S.2136 /H.3210** (Gomez, Ramos, et al., *An Act to remove woody biomass from the greenhouse gas emissions standard for municipal lighting plants*) and **S.2137/H.3211** (Gomez, Ramos, et al., *An Act limiting the eligibility of woody biomass as an alternative energy supply*). These Gomez/Ramos bills remain in your Committee awaiting favorable action.

S.2136/H.3210 would remove biomass from the new MLP GGES' "non-carbon emitting sources" list altogether, to be consistent with the General Court's evolved understanding that incentivizing wood burning for power makes it harder for the Commonwealth to achieve our

³ US EPA, "National Emissions Inventory," (2020) (available at <u>https://www.epa.gov/air-emissions-inventories/2020-national-emissions-inventory-nei-data</u>).

⁴ See Section 102 of Chapter 8 of the Acts of 2021 (the "Climate Roadmap Law").

climate mandates. Biomass is, of course, <u>not</u> a "non-carbon emitting source"; burning wood releases more carbon into the air than the dirtiest fossil fuels.⁵ Moreover, lifecycle analyses show that even when wood "residues" are burned (as opposed to trees logged for fuel), wood heating is a net source of carbon emissions in the atmosphere for decades – well past the timeframe for meaningful climate action.⁶ Including wood in the MLP GGES would funnel money to a polluting industry by subsidizing utility-scale economically unviable wood-burning power plants throughout New England⁷ – plants whose smokestack CO₂ emissions are worse than coal per unit of energy generated.⁼⁸ Power purchase agreements require significantly long lead times to negotiate, so it would be prudent for the Legislature to remove the MLP loophole now, thus ensuring a level playing field and regulatory certainty for all ISO New England participants.

S.2137/H.3211, which we also support, would make large and intermediate-sized heating units that use wood-based fuel (such as wood boilers and furnaces) ineligible for subsidies through Massachusetts' Alternative Energy Portfolio Standard (APS). The APS regulations that Governor Baker's administration adopted in 2017 include weak emissions standards and forest protection guidelines for qualifying biomass heating systems. With this change, the APS "renewable thermal" subsidy will help incentivize truly clean technologies – such as heat pumps, solar hot water, and geothermal systems – without incentivizing more commercial-scale wood burning facilities. (Units defined by regulation as "small" and all units that are already participating in the APS program would not be affected by the bill as filed.)

Please do not include the proposals in sections 8 or 22 of H.4503 in any legislation going forward. Instead, we urge the Legislature to please incorporate the policies of S.2136 /H.3210 and S.2137/H.3211 into the Committee's climate legislation.

⁵ Walker, T., et al. (Jan. 2013). Carbon Accounting for Woody Biomass from Massachusetts (USA) Managed Forests: A Framework for Determining the Temporal Impacts of Wood Biomass Energy on Atmospheric Greenhouse Gas Levels. Journal of Sustainable Forestry 32(1-2):130-158 (available at 10.1080/10549811.2011.652019)

⁶ Laganiere, J., et al. *Range and Uncertainties in Estimating Delays in Greenhouse Gas Mitigation Potential of Forest Bioenergy Sourced from Canadian Forests*, Feb. 2017, GCB Bioenergy (2017)9, 358– 369, (available <u>https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/epdf/10.1111/gcbb.12327</u>); Booth, M.S., *Not Carbon Neutral: Assessing the Net Emissions Impact of Residues Burning for Energy*, Feb. 2018, Environmental Research Letters (available at <u>https://iopscience.iop.org/article/10.1088/1748-9326/aaac88</u>).

⁷ Booth, M. S. (2017). *Maine Bioenergy at the Crossroads: Costs of a Failing Industry*, Partnership for Policy Integrity (available at <u>http://www.pfpi.net/wp-content/uploads/2017/04/</u> PFPI-Maine-Biomass-Report-4-18-17.pdf).

⁸ Booth, M.S. (2014). *Trees, Trash, and Toxics: How Biomass Energy Has Become the New Coal*, PFPI (available at <u>https://www.pfpi.net/wp-content/uploads/2014/04/PFPI-Biomass-is-the-New-Coal-April-2-2014.pdf</u>).

Signed,

Rusty Polsgrove Environmental Justice Organizer Arise for Social Justice Springfield, MA

Anne O'Connor, Co-Chair Bee Friendly Williamstown Williamstown, MA

Jane Winn, Executive Director Berkshire Environmental Action Team (BEAT) Pittsfield, MA

Sharon Shepela, Member Bolton Local Bolton, MA

Fran Ludwig, Co-Chair Boston Catholic Climate Movement Lexington, MA

Lucas Duval Air Quality Monitoring Project Manager Breathe Easy Berkshires Pittsfield, MA

Sallye Bleiberg, Chair Brookhaven Residents' Climate Change Committee Lexington, MA

Candejah Pink, Vice President Chess Angels Promotions Springfield, MA Ann Darling Board of Directors Citizens Awareness Network Easthampton, MA

Jane Dye, Committee Chair Citizens for Holden's Energy Future (CHEF) Holden, MA

Jerry Halberstadt, Coordinator Clean Power Coalition Peabody, MA

Susan Theberge Co-Founder and Steering Committee Member Climate Action Now Western Mass Florence, MA

Regina LaRocque, Leader Climate Code Blue Somerville, MA

Janet Sinclair, Co-Founder Concerned Citizens of Franklin County Greenfield, MA

Phil Thayer, Legislative Liaison ConcordCAN Concord, MA

Johannes Epke, Staff Attorney Conservation Law Foundation Boston, MA Russ Vernon-Jones, Coordinator Earth Ministry Team, First Church Amherst, UCC Amherst, MA

Rick Lent, Leadership Team Member Elders Climate Action – MA Chapter Stow, MA

Anthony Jagodnik, Energy Coach Energy Efficient Bolton Bolton, MA

Kate O'Connor, Coordinator Extinction Rebellion Western Mass Northampton, MA

Nisha Swinton, Senior Organizer Food & Water Watch Washington, DC

Bob Armstrong, Co-Chair Franklin County CPR Climate Task Force Greenfield, MA

Vicky Jenkins, Chair Gill Energy Commission Gill, MA

Anna Linakis, Executive Director Greater Boston Physicians for Social Responsibility Brookline, MA

Marcia Cooper, President Green Newton Newton, MA

Ellen Moyer, Owner Greenvironment, LLC Southampton, MA Kathryn Eiseman, President Hilltown Vision Cummington, MA

Elliott Place HNZ Coordinating Group Member Hingham Net Zero Hingham, MA

Cindy Rowe President and CEO Jewish Alliance for Law and Social Action Boston, MA

Lynn Nadeau, Legs and Regs Committee Jewish Climate Action Network Boston Area, MA

Jennifer Mamola Advocacy and Policy Director John Muir Project of Earth Island Institute Big Bear, CA

Carolyn Lee Natural Resources Legislative Specialist League of Women Voters of Massachusetts Sudbury, MA

Phil Thayer, Board Member Massachusetts Climate Action Network (MCAN) Concord, MA

Chris Matera, Founder Massachusetts Forest Watch Northampton, MA

Cindy Davidson, Executive Director Massachusetts Interfaith Power & Light, Inc. Newton, MA Rev. Jeff Barz-Snell Steering Committee Leader MetroWest Climate Solutions Weston, MA

Cindy Callaway, Co-Coordinator Mothers Out Front Newton Newton, MA

Lis McLoughlin, CEO NatureCulture Northfield, MA

Zulmalee Rivera Events Coordinator Neighbor to Neighbor Springfield, MA

Diane Ring, Co-Founder No Ashland Pipeline Ashland, MA

Rosemary Wessel Program Director No Fracked Gas in Mass Pittsfield, MA

Jerry Rivers, Environmental Scientist North American Climate, Conservation and Environment (NACCE) Roosevelt, NY

Karen Martin, Chair North Parish Climate Justice Group North Andover, MA

Holly Richardson, Director Out Now Springfield, MA Jay McCaffrey New England Legislative Director Partnership for Policy Integrity (PFPI) Pelham, MA

Ken Kipen, Director PATH Ashfield, MA

Chris O'Keeffe, Volunteer Paulist Center Creation Care Ministry Boston, MA

Cathy Kristofferson, Secretary Pipe Line Awareness Network for the Northeast Ashby, MA

Jeanne Krieger, Co-Chair Advocacy Committee Progressive Democrats of Massachusetts(PDM) Lexington, MA

Jonathan Cohn, Policy Director Progressive Massachusetts Boston, MA

James Michel, Co-Founder Resist the Pipeline Boston, MA

Michael Kellett, Executive Director RESTORE: The North Woods Lincoln, MA

Zachary Bouricius, Chairman RVDSA Ecosocialist Committee Montague, MA Janet Sinclair, Co-Founder Save Massachusetts Forests Shelburne Falls, MA

Meg Sheehan, Coordinator Save the Pine Barrens Plymouth, MA

Stephanie Blumenthal, President Sheffield Saves Sheffield, MA

Jess Nahigian, Political Director Sierra Club Massachusetts Cambridge, MA

Mireille Bejjani, Co-Executive Director Slingshot Boston, MA

Tracy Wallace, Vice President South Coast Neighbors United New Bedford, MA

Naia Tenerowicz, Organizer Springfield Climate Justice Coalition Springfield, MA

Rose Webster-Smith, Executive Director Springfield No One Leaves/Nadie Se Mude Springfield, MA

Zack Porter, Executive Director Standing Trees Montpelier, VT

Michael Cavanaugh, Vice President Sustainable Braintree Braintree, MA Kimberly French, Board President Sustainable Middleborough Middleborough, MA

Paul Lauenstein, Board Member Sustainable Sharon Coalition Sharon, MA

Phyllis Theermann, President Sustainable Wellesley Wellesley, MA

Don Ogden Co-Founder/Co-Host The Enviro Show Florence, MA

Janet Cason, President 350 Central Mass Worcester, MA

Carolyn Barthel Executive Committee Member 350 Mass Cambridge, MA

Nicholas Warren 2 Degrees Northampton Northampton, MA

Claire Karl Müller Movement Building Director Unitarian Universalist Mass Action Boston, MA

Verne McArthur, Chair, Green Team Unitarian Universalist Society of Greater Springfield Springfield, MA Laurel Facey, Secretary Wendell State Forest Alliance Wendell, MA

Lundy Bancroft Western Mass Rights of Nature Amherst, MA Susan Kozicz Worcester Congregations for Climate and Environmental Justice Worcester, MA

Cc:

Secretary Rebecca Tepper, Executive Office of Energy and Environmental Affairs Climate Chief Melissa Hoffer, Office of Climate Innovation and Resilience Commissioner Elizabeth Mahoney, Department of Energy Resources Commissioner Bonnie Heiple, Department of Environmental Protection